



For media inquiries, please contact:
Liz Novak, Membership & Communications Manager
Monroe County Bar Association
585-402-7193
585-474-7264 (cell)
lnovak@mcba.org

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE: May 10, 2011

The Monroe County Bar Association Reports its 2011 Judicial Evaluation Results

ROCHESTER, N.Y. — The Monroe County Bar Association (MCBA) today released the rating results of seven persons it has thus far evaluated this year seeking judgeships for New York State Supreme Court, Monroe County Court and Rochester City Court.

The ratings are as follows:

Supreme Court

Hon. Nancy E. Smith	Qualified
Thomas E. Moran	Not Qualified

Monroe County Court

Sandra J. Doorley, Esq.	Qualified
Paul D. Irving, Esq.	Qualified
Hon. Gino M. Nitti	Qualified
Douglas A. Randall, Esq.	Qualified

Rochester City Court

Hon. Melchor E. Castro	Highly Qualified
------------------------	------------------

The MCBA has a three-tier rating system consisting of “highly qualified,” “qualified” and “not qualified.” The ratings are based on an evaluation by hundreds of lawyers and judges who have professional experience with each person being evaluated, along with in-depth research and interviews by the MCBA’s 27-member Judiciary Committee. The evaluation process is designed to be fair and unbiased and is intended to be a public service to provide voters with useful information on a person’s qualifications in seeking judgeship. The MCBA encourages the public to assess each person seeking judgeship independently and make up their own mind come Election Day.

Thorough and impartial evaluation process.

The MCBA evaluates candidates in six categories that are important to being a good judge – experience, legal analysis, judicial temperament and demeanor, ethics and integrity, communication skills and sensitivity to discrimination.

The evaluation process balances two elements that combine to provide a thorough and impartial evaluation.

- *Evaluation by peers.* A survey, representing a cross-section of the legal community, is a key element of the evaluation process. This year, 590 lawyers and judges who have regular professional contact with at least one of the persons being evaluated participated in the survey. The survey was completed electronically through third-party vendor Metrix Matrix, and paper evaluations were made available for those without access to a computer.
- *In-depth interviews and research.* The Bar Association's judiciary committee conducted an in-depth interview and research process, including analysis of legal writings and reference checks, along with interviews of peers and adversaries. The committee is composed of 27 members, who are diverse in race, gender, political affiliation and areas of practice expertise.

Thomas E. Moran declined to be interviewed, so his evaluation was based upon the rest of the information available to the judiciary committee.

To view the rules for the MCBA's judicial evaluations, please go to www.mcba.org/public, or call 585-546-1817.

About the Monroe County Bar Association

The Monroe County Bar Association, originally formed as the Rochester Bar Association, was organized in 1892. What started with just 25 members, has grown to over 2,000 law professionals in Monroe County, committed to improving the quality and accessibility of justice; promoting respect and understanding of the law; enhancing professional growth, fulfillment, excellence, collegiality and diversity among its members; and serving as a voice for the law profession. The MCBA is actively involved with both the New York State Bar and the American Bar Associations and is considered one of the premier local bar associations in the country.

#